

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, et al.,

Case No. 3:20-cv-06057-RS

Plaintiffs,

NOTICE OF DISMISSAL; ORDER

V.

COUNCIL ON ENVIRONMENTAL
QUALITY and BRENDA MALLORY,
in her official capacity as Chair of the
council on Environmental Quality,

Defendants,

AMERICAN FARM BUREAU
FEDERATION, et al.,

Defendant Intervenors

WHEREAS: On August 28, 2020, State Plaintiffs filed this suit to challenge Council on Environmental Quality’s (“CEQ”) July 16, 2020, rulemaking entitled Update to the Regulations Implementing the Procedural Provisions of the National Environmental Policy Act, 85 Fed. Reg. 43,304 (July 16, 2020) (the “2020 Rule”). ECF No. 1.

WHEREAS: On November 5, 2020, the Court granted American Farm Bureau Federation et al's motion to intervene as Defendants in this matter.

WHEREAS: This case was stayed by the Court on February 12, 2021, to accommodate Defendant the CEQ's review of the 2020 Rule pursuant to Executive Order 13990: 'Protecting Public Health and the Environment and Restoring Science to Tackle the Climate Crisis.' 86 Fed. Reg. 7,037 (Jan. 25, 2021). ECF No. 82.

WHEREAS: Through a series of Court Orders, the stay of this case has been extended eleven times until April 4, 2024 to accommodate the following rulemakings by CEQ revising

1 National Environmental Policy Act's ("NEPA") implementing regulations: the Final Interim
2 Rule, 86 Fed. Reg. 34,154 (June 29, 2021); the National Environmental Policy Act
3 Implementing Regulations Revisions, 87 Fed. Reg. 23,453 (April 20, 2022); and the
4 Bipartisan Permitting Reform Implementation Rule, 85 Fed. Reg. 35,4432, 35,4448 (May 1,
5 2024) (the "2024 Rule"). ECF Nos. 84, 89, 92, 96, 102, 104, 108, 110, 118, and 124.

6 WHEREAS: Following the promulgation of the 2024 Rule on May 1, 2024, the Parties
7 agreed to request a further stay until September 9, 2024, to allow State Plaintiffs to review and
8 analyze the 2024 Rule and its impact on State Plaintiffs' challenge. ECF No. 123.

9 WHEREAS: Upon expiration of the stay, State Plaintiffs asked that the Court further
10 extend the stay in the Parties' joint status report filed on September 19, 2024. ECF No. 127.
11 State Plaintiffs argued that the instant case is not moot, this Court retains jurisdiction and can
12 enter a stay, and an extension of the stay is warranted to accommodate a forthcoming decision
13 in a case filed in the District Court of North Dakota challenging the 2024 Rule and seeking its
14 vacatur and reinstatement of the 2020 Rule, which is challenged in this litigation. ECF No.
15 127.

16 WHEREAS: In the joint status report, Federal Defendants argued that this case is moot
17 and an extension of the stay is not warranted. ECF No. 127.

18 WHEREAS: At a Status Conference held before this Court on September 26, 2024,
19 State Plaintiffs argued for a further extension of the stay and Federal Defendants argued
20 against a further stay.

21 WHEREAS: Upon conclusion of the Status Conference, having heard arguments from
22 all Parties, this Court stated it would dismiss the case as moot and directed the parties to file a
23 stipulation to that effect. ECF No. 129.

24 WHEREAS: State Plaintiffs respectfully disagree with this Court's assessment that this
case is moot and should be dismissed.

WHEREAS: State Plaintiffs and Federal Defendants were not able to reach agreement
on language for a stipulated dismissal.

ACCORDINGLY, State Plaintiffs hereby dismiss this action without prejudice at the direction

of the Court.

ROB BONTA
Attorney General of California

/s/ Jamie Jefferson
SARAH E. MORRISON, SBN 143459
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
THOMAS SCHUMANN, SBN 324559
JAMIE JEFFERSON, SBN 197142
Deputy Attorneys General
1515 Clay Street, 20th Floor
Oakland, CA 94602
(510) 879-3298
Jamie.Jefferson@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California

ROBERT W. FERGUSON
Attorney General of Washington

*ELIZABETH HARRIS, Pro Hac Vice
Assistant Attorney General
Washington Attorney General's Office
Environmental Protection Division
800 5th Ave., Ste. 2000 TB-14
Seattle, Washington 98104-3188
(206) 233-3391
Elizabeth.Harris@atg.wa.gov*

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Washington

1
2 PHILIP J. WEISER
3 Attorney General of Colorado

4 /s/ Scott Steinbrecher
5 SCOTT STEINBRECHER, *Pro Hac Vice*
6 Deputy Attorney General
7 Ralph C. Carr Colorado Judicial Center
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor
Denver, Colorado 80203
(720) 508-6287
Scott.Steinbrecher@coag.gov

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado*

9
10 KATHERINE S. DYKES
11 Commissioner Connecticut Department of
12 Energy and Environmental Protection

13 /s/ Kirsten S. P. Rigney
14 KIRSTEN S. P. RIGNEY
15 Director, Legal Office
16 Department of Energy and
17 Environmental Protection
18 10 Franklin Square
19 New Britain, CT 06051
(860) 827-2984

20 /s/ Robert Snook
21 ROBERT SNOOK
22 Assistant Attorney General
23 10 Franklin Square
24 New Britain, CT 06051
(860) 827-2620
Robert.Snook@ct.gov

25 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Connecticut &*
26 *Department of Energy and*
27 *Environmental Protection*

2 WILLIAM TONG
3 Attorney General of Connecticut

4 /s/ Robert Snook
5 ROBERT SNOOK, *Pro Hac Vice*
6 Assistant Attorney General
7 Attorney General's Office
165 Capitol Avenue
Hartford, Connecticut, 06106
(860) 808-5250
Robert.Snook@ct.gov

8 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Connecticut*

9
10 KATHLEEN JENNINGS
11 Attorney General of Delaware

12 /s/ Vanessa L. Kassab
13 CHRISTIAN DOUGLAS WRIGHT
14 Director of Impact Litigation
15 RALPH K. DURSTEIN III
16 VANESSA L. KASSAB
17 Deputy Attorneys General
18 Delaware Department of Justice
19 820 N. French Street
Wilmington, DE 19801
(302) 577-8600
Christian.Wright@delaware.gov
Jameson.Tweedie@delaware.gov

20 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Delaware*

1 KWAME RAOUL
2 Attorney General of Illinois

3 /s/ Jason E. James
4 JASON E. JAMES, *Pro Hac Vice*
5 Assistant Attorney General
6 MATTHEW J. DUNN
7 Chief, Environmental Enforcement/
8 Asbestos Litigation Division
9 Office of the Attorney General
Environmental Bureau
10 201 West Pointe Drive, Suite 7
11 Belleville, IL 62226
(872) 276-3583
Jason.James@ilag.gov

12 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Illinois*

13 ANTHONY G. BROWN
14 Attorney General of Maryland

15 /s/ Steven J. Goldstein
16 STEVEN J. GOLDSTEIN
17 Special Assistant Attorney General
18 200 Saint Paul Place, 20th Floor
19 Baltimore, MD 21202
(410) 576-6414
sgoldstein@oag.state.md.us

20 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Maryland*

21 AARON FREY
22 Maine Attorney General

23 /s/ Jillian R. O'Brien
24 JILLIAN R. O'BRIEN, SBN 251311
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
6 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04333-0006
jill.obrien@maine.gov
(207) 626-8582

25 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Maine*

26 DANA NESSEL
27 Attorney General of Michigan

28 /s/ Elizabeth Morrisseau
29 ELIZABETH MORRISSEAU, *Pro Hac
30 Vice*
31 Assistant Attorney General
32 Environment, Natural Resources, and
33 Agriculture Division
34 6th Floor G. Mennen Williams Building
35 525 W. Ottawa Street
36 P.O. Box 30755
37 Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-7664
MorrisseauE@michigan.gov

38 *Attorney for Plaintiff the People of the
39 State of Michigan*

1 KEITH ELLISON
2 Attorney General of Minnesota

3 /s/ Peter N. Surdo
4 PETER N. SURDO, *Pro Hac Vice*
5 Special Assistant Attorney General
6 445 Minnesota Street
7 Town Square Tower Suite 1400
8 Saint Paul, MN 55101
9 (651) 757-1061
10 Peter.Surdo@ag.state.mn.us

11 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State
12 of Minnesota*

13 MATTHEW J. PLATKIN
14 Attorney General of New Jersey

15 /s/ Lisa Morelli
16 LISA MORELLI
17 Deputy Attorneys General
18 Environmental Permitting and
19 Counseling
20 R.J. Hughes Justice Complex
21 P.O. Box 093
22 Trenton, NJ 08625
23 (609) 376-2804

24 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New Jersey
Proposed Order California v. CEQ, No.
3:20-cv-06057-RS*

AARON D. FORD
Attorney General of Nevada

/s/ Heidi Parry Stern
HEIDI PARRY STERN, *Pro Hac Vice*
Solicitor General
Office of the Nevada Attorney General
100 N. Carson Street
Carson City, NV 89701
(702) 245-5322
HStern@ag.nv.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Nevada

RAÚL TORREZ
Attorney General of New Mexico

/s/ William Grantham
WILLIAM GRANTHAM
Assistant Attorney General
201 Third Street NW, Suite 300
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102
(505) 717-3520
wgrantham@nmag.gov

Attorneys for the State of New Mexico

LETITIA JAMES
Attorney General of New York

JOSHUA H. STEIN
Attorney General of North Carolina

/s/ Claiborne E. Walthall
CLAIBORNE E. WALTHALL, *Pro Hac Vice*
Assistant Attorney General
New York State Office of
the Attorney General
State Capitol
Albany, NY 12224
(518) 776-2380
claiborne.walthall@ag.ny.gov

DANIEL S. HIRSCHMAN
Senior Deputy Attorney General

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of New York and New York State Department of Environmental Conservation

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of
North Carolina*

ELLEN ROSENBLUM
Attorney General of Oregon

PETER F. NERONHA
Attorney General of Rhode Island

/s/ Paul Garrahan
PAUL GARRAHAN, *Pro Hac Vice*
Attorney-in-Charge
STEVE NOVICK
Special Assistant Attorney General
Natural Resources Section
Oregon Department of Justice
1162 Court Street NE
Salem, OR 97301-4096
(503) 947-4540
Paul.Garrahan@doj.state.or.us
Steve.Novick@doj.state.or.us

/s/ Gregory S. Schultz
GREGORY S. SCHULTZ, *Pro Hac Vice*
Special Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
Environmental and Energy Unit
150 South Main Street
Providence, RI 02903
(401) 274-4400
gschultz@riag.ri.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Oregon

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island

1 CHARITY R. CLARK
2 Attorney General of Vermont

3 */s/ Ryan Kane*
4 RYAN KANE
5 Assistant Attorney General
6 Office of the Attorney General
7 109 State Street
8 Montpelier, VT 05609
9 (802) 828-6902
10 ryan.kane@vermont.gov

11 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Vermont*

12 ANDREA JOY CAMPBELL
13 Attorney General of Massachusetts

14 */s/ Turner H. Smith*
15 TURNER H. SMITH, *Pro Hac Vice*
16 Assistant Attorney General
17 Deputy Bureau Chief
18 MATTHEW IRELAND, *Pro Hac Vice*
19 Assistant Attorney General
20 Office of the Attorney General
21 Energy and Environment Bureau
22 One Ashburton Place, 18th Floor
23 Boston, MA 02108
24 (617) 727-2200
25 Turner.Smith@mass.gov
26 Matthew.Ireland@mass.gov

27 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Commonwealth of*
28 *Pennsylvania*

1 JOSHUA L. KAUL
2 Attorney General of Wisconsin

3 */s/ Tressie K. Kamp*
4 TRESSIE K. KAMP
5 Assistant Attorney General
6 Wisconsin Department of Justice
7 17 W. Main Street
8 Madison, WI 53707-7857
9 (608) 266-9595
10 kamptk@doj.state.wi.us

11 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Wisconsin*

12 JOSH SHAPIRO
13 Attorney General of Pennsylvania

14 MICHAEL J. FISCHER
15 Chief Deputy Attorney General

16 */s/ Ann R. Johnston*
17 ANN R. JOHNSTON, *Pro Hac Vice*
18 Senior Deputy Attorney General
19 Office of Attorney General
20 Strawberry Square, 14th Floor
21 Harrisburg, PA 17120
22 (717) 705-6938
23 ajohnston@attorneygeneral.gov

24 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Commonwealth of*
25 *Pennsylvania*

1 DOUGLAS B. MOYLAN
2 Attorney General of Guam

3 /s/ Joseph A. Perez
4 JOSEPH A. PEREZ *Pro Hac Vice*
5 Assistant Attorney General
6 Consumer Protection Division
7 590 South Marine Corps Drive,
8 Suite 901, ITC Building
9 Tamuning, Guam 96913 • USA
10 (671) 475-3324
11 jperez@oagguam.org

12 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Territory
13 of Guam*

BRIAN L. SCHWALB
Attorney General for the
District of Columbia

JENNIFER C. JONES
Deputy Attorney General
Public Advocacy Division

/s/ Adam Teitelbaum
ADAM TEITELBAUM
Deputy Director, Office
of Consumer Protection
WESLEY ROSENFELD
Assistant Attorney General
District of Columbia Office of the
Attorney
General
400 6th Street, NW
Washington, D.C. 20001
(202) 256-3713
adam.teitelbaum@dc.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff District of
14 Columbia*

15 HON. SYLVIA O. HINDS-RADIX
16 Corporation Counsel of the
17 City of New York

/s/ Nathan Taylor

NATHAN TAYLOR
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street, Rm 6-144
New York, NY 10007
(646) 940-0736 (m)
(212) 356-2315

NTaylor@law.nyc.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff City of New York

CHRISTIAN D. MENEFEE
Harris County Attorney

/s/ Sarah Jane Utley
SARAH JANE UTLEY*
Environment Division Director
Harris County Attorney's Office
1019 Congress, 15th Floor
Houston, Texas 77002
(713) 274-5124
sarah.utley@harriscountytexas.gov.

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Harris County,
18 Texas*

21
22 * In compliance with Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), the filer of this document attests that all signatories
23 listed have concurred in the filing of this document.

1 IT IS SO ORDERED.
2

3
4 Dated: 10/28/2024
5

6 
7 Richard Seeborg
8 CHIEF UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
9

10 Respectfully submitted this 10th day of October, 2024.
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24